

National Advisory Committee on Racial, Ethnic and Other Populations

Fall Meeting

U.S. Census Bureau

4600 Silver Hill Road, Suitland, MD 20746

November 3-4, 2016

Submitted by: Ditas Katague, NAC Chair

Date: November 9, 2016

Language Working Group Recommendations

[Consensus]

Language Coverage

Recommendation #1: We re-affirm and adopt recommendations from the Hard-to-Count Working Group related to language access.

- Offering Additional Language Options: In order to reach HTC groups who have high numbers of immigrants and persons with limited English, we recommend that the internet interfaces include as many languages as possible. Online forms could potentially include many more languages than the printed version.
- Prioritizing Language Minority Communities with a High Incidence of Limited English Proficiency: When choosing languages for translation, we recommend the Census Bureau consider not just the number of speakers, but smaller language communities that can only respond in their own language.
- Targeting HTC Communities Through Mapping: For example, in order to best target HTC groups with limited English, we recommend the Census Bureau provide data mapping by language so that areas with LEP individuals are highlighted and can be specifically targeted.

Census Bureau Response:

The U.S. Census Bureau plans to deploy an expanded language program for the 2020 Census, compared to what was done in 2010. While final plans will depend upon budget, resource, and system capabilities, the current plan would support the development of an Internet questionnaire in approximately 10 languages, Census Questionnaire Assistance interviews in approximately 10 languages, and the development of video and paper Language Assistance Guides (LAGs) in approximately 60 languages, including a number of smaller language groups. To meet the needs of remaining language groups, we will use Partnership Specialists and Assistants, who provided language capabilities in 145 languages during the 2010 Census.

We will use the American Community Survey (ACS) 5-year and 1-year estimates to identify language groups with a high number of households in which household members speak a language other than English at home, as well as households in which no one age 14 and over speaks English “very well” or speaks English only. We will then examine this list and determine how best to meet each language community’s needs.

To identify language communities geographically, and assist Partnership Specialists in preparing to serve smaller language communities, the Census Bureau has defined requirements for an application to display selected variables from the planning database

National Advisory Committee on Racial, Ethnic and Other Populations

Fall Meeting

U.S. Census Bureau

4600 Silver Hill Road, Suitland, MD 20746

November 3-4, 2016

within a map interface down to census tracts. This application is intended for not only the general public, but specifically for Partnership Specialists and regional staff to help them plan resources and activities around areas with expected lower response rates. As this application moves forward in development, the Census Bureau will look at ways to integrate ACS language data in addition to the information already selected for inclusion from the planning database.

Recommendation #2: We recommend the Census Bureau produce Tier 1 materials (Questionnaires, Language Assistance Guides, Questionnaire Assistance Centers, Telephone Questionnaire Assistance interviews, Website, Partnership Program) for the top 10 languages for the largest “linguistically isolated”¹ languages, using the most recent ACS 5-year dataset, and the top ten languages covered by Section 203 of the Voting Rights Act.

Census Bureau Response:

The Census Bureau is no longer using the tier terminology, but we plan to expand on the 2010 Census language program (where questionnaires were available in five languages) by supporting the development of an Internet questionnaire and Census Questionnaire Assistance in approximately 10 languages, the development of Language Assistance Guides (LAGs) in approximately 60 languages, and Partnership Staff support in as many languages as possible (145 languages during the 2010 Census).

We plan to consult the most recent ACS 5-year and 1-year estimates when finalizing the list of languages supported for the 2020 Census. This analysis will identify languages with a large number of households in which household members speak a language other than English at home, as well as households in which no one age 14 and over speaks English “very well” or speaks English only.

The 2016 determination of languages for Section 203 of the Voting Rights Act, released in December 2016, also used the ACS data. There are some differences in methodology between the analysis that will be used for the 2020 Census language support determination and the analysis used to satisfy Section 203 requirements. For example, for the purpose of Section 203 determinations, individuals who are not U.S. citizens and/or not of voting age are automatically excluded from the estimates.

An analysis of ACS data conducted specifically to select the 2020 Census languages will provide a more accurate representation of language needs for all potential respondents, at both the national level and the census tract or local area level. However, we appreciate the recommendation to consider the list of Section 203 languages and, more specifically, the guidance provided by Recommendation #6 and others to leverage the resources

¹ Starting in 2010, the term “linguistic isolation” has been replaced with “Households in which no one 14 and over speaks English only or speaks a language other than English at home and speaks English very well.” This report utilizes “linguistic isolation” to mean its replacement terminology.

National Advisory Committee on Racial, Ethnic and Other Populations

Fall Meeting

U.S. Census Bureau

4600 Silver Hill Road, Suitland, MD 20746

November 3-4, 2016

created and used to communicate with area-specific language concentrations about voting rights.

As noted in the response to Recommendation #1, the Census Bureau plans to provide the Internet questionnaire and Census Questionnaire Assistance in approximately 10 languages, as well as assistance in additional languages through the LAGs, partnership efforts, and census.gov information.

Recommendation #3: We recommend the Census Bureau produce Tier 2 materials (Language Assistance Guides, Questionnaire Assistance Center, Website, Partnership Program) in 90 languages, which increases the languages supported by approximately 50% from the 2010 Census.

We further recommend that the languages chosen for Tier 2 materials should not only serve large language population groups but also:

- service smaller language groups with greater needs (i.e. those groups that have large percentages of limited-English proficiency or linguistic isolation)
- address language needs of those geographically-concentrated (i.e., populations that make up a significant portion of a geographic location such as a city, state or region even though the language group may not be equally populous throughout the country) and/or geographically-isolated; and
- serve language groups from the US refugee program in the last 10 years.

Census Bureau Response:

As noted in the response to Recommendation #2, the Census Bureau is no longer using the tier terminology. In addition, we do not plan to produce the Language Assistance Guides (LAGs) in 90 languages, but in approximately 60 languages. This will include smaller language groups, as well as languages spoken by the largest refugee groups in the last 10 years, based on the nationality of the principal applicant.²

While it may not be cost-effective to produce these materials for more than 60 languages, and still meet our goal of lowering the cost per household, we will use a robust network of Partnership Specialists to focus on small language groups, including geographically concentrated language groups. In 2010, the Census Bureau employed Partnership Specialists and Assistants with capabilities in 145 languages. We plan to support the effort to recruit Partnership Staff with as much language capability as possible and provide Partnership Staff with the resources needed to engage all respondents in their preferred language. Many non-English speaking respondents may be best encouraged to respond by direct interaction with Partnership Specialists in their communities and engagement with the trusted voices who partner with the Census Bureau.

² Source - <http://www.wrapsnet.org/s/Top-Ten-Refugee-Native-Languages162017.xls>

National Advisory Committee on Racial, Ethnic and Other Populations

Fall Meeting

U.S. Census Bureau

4600 Silver Hill Road, Suitland, MD 20746

November 3-4, 2016

Recommendation #4: We recommend the Census Bureau produce Tier 3 materials (Language Assistance Guides, Website, Partnership Program) in languages that service smaller language groups with some needs (i.e. those groups that have a significant percentages of limited-English proficiency or linguistic isolation) as well as address language needs of those geographically-concentrated (i.e., populations that make up a good portion of a geographic location such as a city, state or region even though the language group may not be equally populous throughout the country).

Census Bureau Response:

As explained in the response to Recommendation #3, the Census Bureau will produce Language Assistance Guides (LAGs) for approximately 60 languages using an analysis of the ACS 5-year and 1-year estimates. The LAGs will be available by print and the web, and the list will include a number of smaller language groups.

With respect to partnership efforts, as referenced in the response to Recommendation #1, we hope that Partnership Specialists and regional staff will be able to use an application to identify geographically concentrated languages and determine how best to engage those communities. As this application moves forward in development, the Census Bureau will look at ways to support the effort to recruit Partnership Staff able to communicate in as many languages as possible, and provide Partnership Staff with the resources needed to engage all respondents in their preferred language. For the 2010 Census, the Census Bureau employed Partnership Specialists and Assistants with capabilities in 145 languages.

Recommendation #5: We recommend the Census Bureau create a time-specific process to solicit additional feedback from interested stakeholders for more niche/unique languages in more language-diverse neighborhoods and communities. That process should require interested stakeholders to provide the language they believe should be served, the reason why it should be served (anecdotal and/or statistical evidence), and contacts for individuals or companies that can service that language.

Census Bureau Response:

During the 2010 Census, advisory groups, partners, and community members played an important role in providing feedback on the supported languages. The Census Bureau plans to establish guidelines and appropriate time periods for gathering feedback from our stakeholders in preparation for the 2020 Census.

Recommendation #6: We recommend the development of a specific language strategy for Alaska Natives and American Indians. We further recommend that the Census Bureau look into collaborative opportunities at the state level for those responsible for providing language assistance for voters – for example perhaps partnering with jurisdictions covered by Section 203 for a translation partnership, using existing bilingual translation panels, translators, and outreach workers.

National Advisory Committee on Racial, Ethnic and Other Populations

Fall Meeting

U.S. Census Bureau

4600 Silver Hill Road, Suitland, MD 20746

November 3-4, 2016

Census Bureau Response:

The Census Bureau recognizes that each tribal community and urban or rural American Indian and Alaska Native (AIAN) population is unique. There are multiple avenues used to incorporate the AIAN languages. The Census Bureau's AIAN program works closely with tribal governments and includes the Tribal Government Liaison Program (TGLP), Tribal Complete Count Committees (TCCC), and working with AIAN organizations and businesses.

For the TGLP, the tribal leader is asked to select a tribal representative to work with the Census Bureau. During the 2010 Census, the Census Bureau worked with Tribal Governments Liaisons to ensure that all census materials were sensitive to the cultural and language needs of tribal members and to involve cultural experts and speakers of the tribal languages in recruiting, testing, training, and outreach activities.

The TCCC is an organized committee developed by the tribal leader. Those that sit on the committee are selected by the tribal leader and may include representatives from tribal language or cultural departments in addition to experts in other matters. The outreach and promotion campaign is developed and conducted by the TCCC. It can consist of educational programs, health programs, language programs, and recruitment programs, to name a few. Many success stories from the 2010 Census included developing outreach materials and trusted voices in a tribe's language. In addition, the Census Bureau hires partnership assistants and cultural facilitators from the tribes.

These efforts for the 2020 Census began in 2015 by conducting 18 tribal consultations, in which tribal leaders recommended keeping the TGLP and the TCCCs for the 2020 Census. As the outreach and promotion efforts are developed for the 2020 Census, we will work together across operations to ensure that the TCCCs and TGLP are able to provide language assistance to AIAN respondents.

Recommendation #7: We recommend that the Census Bureau be mindful of persons with disabilities and ensure accessibility to the 2020 Census and its materials by the use of Braille, American Sign Language, TTY and any other tools that would increase accessibility for these communities.

Census Bureau Response:

In order to encourage self-response to the 2020 Census among non-English speaking populations, the Census Bureau will provide Language Assistance Guides (LAGs) to assist respondents in understanding and completing the 2020 Census online and/or using the paper questionnaire. Any material presented online, including digital or electronic LAGs (including PDF, video, etc.) must be compliant with Section 508 of the Rehabilitation Act of 1974, in order to provide comparable access to people with disabilities. Additionally, we plan to provide LAGs in large print, braille, and American Sign Language. Finally, assistance is always available to everyone over the phone, including by TTY phone lines.

National Advisory Committee on Racial, Ethnic and Other Populations

Fall Meeting

U.S. Census Bureau

4600 Silver Hill Road, Suitland, MD 20746

November 3-4, 2016

Translation Process

Recommendation #8: We recommend that Census Bureau incorporate trusted community-based organizations (including organizations representing persons with disabilities) in reviewing all non-English materials, including, but not limited to, any glossaries, non-English mailing materials, and the Census Questionnaire. The Census Bureau should provide organizations with sufficient time and voice to provide input on cultural appropriateness and translation quality prior to finalizing translations and materials.

Census Bureau Response:

The Census Bureau uses a process of pretesting translated materials, including joint usability and cognitive testing of questionnaires and materials in non-English languages. The goal of this pre testing is to obtain feedback from respondents on translated wording. Participants are recruited from various regions of the country, are demographically diverse (age, gender, etc.), have diverse education levels and household compositions, and have varying levels of English proficiency. Feedback from cognitive testing is used to create standardized translation glossaries, which are used consistently across all non-English materials.

In addition, during the 2010 Census, the Census Bureau employed Partnership Specialists and Assistants with capabilities in 145 languages to conduct outreach with local partner organizations and respondents. For the 2020 Census, we will continue to engage partner organizations and the diverse communities they represent through the Community Partnership and Engagement Program. The Census Bureau plans to establish guidelines and appropriate time periods for gathering feedback from these stakeholders on translated materials that can be used to motivate toward greater participation in the 2020 Census, to provide outreach to populations with historically low response rates and undercounts, and to deliver messages through trusted community leaders.

Recommendation #9: We recommend that the Census Bureau establish and publish official translation guidelines.

Census Bureau Response:

The Census Bureau follows documented best practices within the translation industry – specifically, the translation guidelines set forth in ASTM International’s F2575-14 *Standard Guide for Quality Assurance in Translation*. Therefore, we do not plan to issue a separate set of translation guidelines.

ASTM International is one of the largest voluntary standards developing organizations in the world, providing a forum for the development and publication of international voluntary consensus standards for materials, products, systems, and services. ASTM International has published F2575-14 *Standard Guide for Quality Assurance in*

National Advisory Committee on Racial, Ethnic and Other Populations

Fall Meeting

U.S. Census Bureau

4600 Silver Hill Road, Suitland, MD 20746

November 3-4, 2016

Translation to ensure that organizations procuring translation services are able to obtain the level of quality, subject matter expertise, and project management experience that best match the organization's requirements. Individual linguists and representatives of translation companies, academic institutions, federal government organizations, and companies, and institutions purchasing translation services all contributed to the creation of this standard.

ASTM F2575 was created with the intent of minimizing the number of guidelines or standards that would be used within the translation industry; and a major goal of ASTM F2575 was to create a common vocabulary and set of best practices for the industry. ASTM F2575 has been widely adopted in the translation industry because of the incorporation of previously established best practices and the diverse stakeholders involved in the drafting process. These guidelines were first adopted for use in the federal government by the Department of State's Office of Language Services in 2009.

ASTM F2575 includes a standardized method to define holistic quality assurance processes for each translation project. To ensure that the quality assurance process reflects the specific needs of translated data collection instruments and supporting materials, the Census Bureau incorporates translation pretesting best practices in addition to editing, proofreading, and terminology management. The need for pretesting was previously documented in a 2005 report by the Census Bureau's Research and Methodology Directorate, *Census Bureau Guideline for the Translation of Data Collection Instruments and Supporting Materials: Documentation on how the Guideline Was Developed*.

Recommendation #10: We recommend the Census Bureau build a database of individual translation contractors for a multitude of languages, recognizing that translation agencies that serve multiple languages may not be the best for specific languages. We further recommend that the Census Bureau consider sharing the database with other agencies and partner organizations.

Census Bureau Response:

The U.S. federal government maintains a section of the General Services Administration (GSA) schedule specifically for the purpose of ensuring that all federal agencies have access to a list of translation vendors that meet the diverse translation requirements of these agencies. This list can be found under the Language Services section of the GSA Schedule, under category 3821 – Translation Services. The list includes 83 vendors and allows federal agencies to identify in which languages a vendor specializes.

Recommendation #11: We recommend that the Census Bureau hire permanent, full-time staff to be responsible for coordination of translations for other languages beside Spanish, such as an Asian language translation coordinator or an AIAN language translation coordinator, to support surveys conducted by the Census Bureau.

National Advisory Committee on Racial, Ethnic and Other Populations

Fall Meeting

U.S. Census Bureau

4600 Silver Hill Road, Suitland, MD 20746

November 3-4, 2016

Census Bureau Response:

The current permanent staff at the Census Bureau managing the decennial translation and language services operations includes individuals fluent in Spanish, Chinese, Korean, and Russian. While potential candidates must also meet requirements for education and experience, we recognize the value of non-English skillsets and professional translation experience.

The Census Bureau is dedicated to identifying professional translators who are qualified to assist with the translation of our materials. We have a translation project manager position to ensure proper quality assurance measures are put in place for each translation, in accordance with ASTM 2575. We also have a translation research coordinator position that oversees terminology management across all languages and the use of translation technology.

In addition, we are implementing the use of Computer Assisted Translation (CAT) tools to increase terminology and style consistency in translations. When translators work on new material, the entire database is searched so that translators can access all relevant previous translations immediately, ensuring consistency and increasing speed. CAT tools also allow for maintenance of terminology databases that alert translators each time there is a terminology match in the document they are translating.

Recommendation #12: We recommend the Census Bureau conduct a cost-benefit analysis to provide language support for all census surveys, and in particular the American Community Survey and the Current Population Survey, for at least the top 5 languages to reduce in-person follow-up for these surveys.

Census Bureau Response:

The Census Bureau understands the importance of providing language support to our respondents across the portfolio of surveys. As an example, the first mail packet for households selected for the American Community Survey (ACS) includes a brochure providing basic survey information in English, Spanish, Russian, Chinese, Vietnamese, and Korean; and the survey and instruction guides for completing the ACS questionnaire are published in English and Spanish. Households can request an ACS Language Assistance Guide in Simplified Chinese and Korean, and *Questions and Answers* brochures in Arabic, Chinese, English, French, Haitian Creole, Korean, Polish, Portuguese, Russian, Spanish, and Vietnamese. ACS call centers have staff available to provide assistance in multiple languages to help survey respondents complete the ACS over the phone, and respondents can request that a bilingual Census Bureau field representative conduct an in-person ACS interview as well.

The Census Bureau continues to make improvements to survey operations and will consider new efforts to support non-English languages for survey respondents.

National Advisory Committee on Racial, Ethnic and Other Populations

Fall Meeting

U.S. Census Bureau

4600 Silver Hill Road, Suitland, MD 20746

November 3-4, 2016

Recommendation #13: Based on the preliminary results of the 2016 Census Test, we recommend that the Census Bureau should include non-English messaging on the ENVELOPE of mailings in addition to non-English materials and/or messaging inside.

Census Bureau Response:

During the 2016 Census Test, the Census Bureau researched different methods of increasing self-response from non-English speaking respondents. This included messages printed on the outside of envelopes (in English, Spanish, Chinese, and Korean) to encourage respondents to open the envelopes and participate in the test. We plan to continue exploring different ways of reaching non-English speakers for the 2020 Census to maximize response from all language and demographic groups.

Recommendation #14: Based on the preliminary results of the 2016 Census Test, we recommend the Census Bureau must include non-English materials in the mailings that provide respondents with useful information about why to participate and how to participate.

Census Bureau Response:

Through mid-decade testing, the Census Bureau has provided respondents with materials that explain the purpose of the tests, benefits of participating, and different methods of participating online, by telephone, and on paper. The non-English materials have included several letters, an informational insert explaining the Census Questionnaire Assistance support in several languages, postcards, multilingual brochures, and bilingual questionnaires. These materials were translated to support languages and provide information about why and how to participate.

We also deployed non-English partnership toolkits for the tests, which provided information for partners to use to motivate people to respond to the 2016 Census Test, including:

- Fact sheets about the test and test locations.
- Information geared toward the concerns of various communities.
- Frequently Asked Questions.
- 2016 Census Test questions.
- Promotional and informational email samples.
- Newsletter and media article samples.
- Event hosting tips.
- Social media templates.
- Lists of places with computers that could be used to respond to the Test.

National Advisory Committee on Racial, Ethnic and Other Populations

Fall Meeting

U.S. Census Bureau

4600 Silver Hill Road, Suitland, MD 20746

November 3-4, 2016

These toolkits were available in print and on census.gov.³ We plan to continue exploring different methods of deploying and enhancing this information for the 2020 Census, including the enhancement of non-English messaging.

Recommendation #14.5: For languages for which assistance is available through other means, we recommend that the Census Bureau provide a toll-free number (ideally translated) in mailings to request that assistance.

Census Bureau Response:

Similar to the 2010 Census and the 2020 mid-decade tests, the Census Bureau is planning to include mailing inserts that will list the toll-free numbers of each non-English language available by Census Questionnaire Assistance (CQA). The insert includes non-English text in each of the listed languages, directing respondents to call for assistance and/or to provide a response by phone. The CQA centers will assist respondents in multiple languages, and callers will be able to provide their responses over the phone and/or request that printed copies of Language Assistance Guides be mailed to them, in the supported languages. In addition, the Community Partnership and Engagement Program will work with partners to provide opportunities and locations for people to attend partnership events where assistance with responding in specific languages is provided in person.

Recommendation #15: We recommend that the Census Bureau continue to test and refine the non-English materials that go into the mailings to determine which format and what information will promote the highest level of self-response from language communities.

Census Bureau Response:

The Census Bureau is working to refine the non-English instruments and materials planned for the 2020 Census to help reduce language barriers to enumeration, ensure consistency across languages, and promote high response rates and accurate/consistent responses from respondents of Limited English Proficiency (LEP). We are also measuring self-response in the supported languages to help enhance non-English materials and messaging about these response options for the 2020 Census.

We are also continuing to examine usability and cognitive issues and translation appropriateness to ensure consistent messaging across modes and languages. We are currently working with our multilingual research contractor (RTI International) to test the full scope of the data collection instrument in multiple languages and other materials deployed to LEP households, as well as collaborating with the Language and Cross-Cultural Research Group within the Center for Survey Measurement with instrument testing.

³ Partnership Toolkits available at www.census.gov/programs-surveys/decennial-census/2020-census/research-testing/testing-activities/2016-census-test/partners.html

National Advisory Committee on Racial, Ethnic and Other Populations

Fall Meeting

U.S. Census Bureau

4600 Silver Hill Road, Suitland, MD 20746

November 3-4, 2016

Recommendation #16: We recommend that the Census Bureau consider different metrics for evaluating the use and quality of the different non-English materials beyond relying only on the number of downloads, such as determining how partners used the materials.

Census Bureau Response:

During the 2010 Census, the Census Bureau assessed the language program by examining the language selection process and the means in which non-English materials were translated into the supported languages and the sufficiency of these materials by type and quantity. The analysis was conducted using data sources such as lessons learned documents, census reports and documents, and other tracking reports. We intend to use many of these resources again to evaluate the 2020 Census language program, and will again rely on lessons learned documents to help us understand the Partnership Specialists' experience with these materials.

We are also exploring the feasibility of automating reports and measuring the performance of language materials across response modes including Internet Self-Response and Census Questionnaire Assistance. In addition to the analysis mentioned in #14.5 and #15, we plan to explore how respondents are directed to the census.gov language pages, which pages they visit while there, and whether respondents choose to visit the Internet questionnaire after exploring these pages. We will also obtain feedback from respondents on translated wording used through the cognitive interviews and usability testing.

Recommendation #17: We recommend the Census Bureau analyze how accurately the Language tracts identified target populations for the Census 2016 test by the different language groups.

Census Bureau Response:

The Census Bureau is assessing the 2016 Census Test results. The analysis of our findings is forthcoming and will include an in-depth analysis of which languages were used by respondents in each of the census tracts.

National Advisory Committee on Racial, Ethnic and Other Populations

Fall Meeting

U.S. Census Bureau

4600 Silver Hill Road, Suitland, MD 20746

November 3-4, 2016

Enumerator Tools/Respondent Materials

Recommendation #18: We recommend that the Enumerator Tools/respondent materials be developed with a focus on end-user.

Census Bureau Response:

As noted in the response to Recommendation #8, the Census Bureau is working with our multilingual research contractor (RTI International) to test the full scope of our non-English instruments and materials, including joint usability and cognitive testing of questionnaires and materials in non-English languages. The goal of this pretesting is to obtain feedback from respondents on the translated wording. Participants are recruited from various regions of the country, are demographically diverse (age, gender, etc.), have diverse education levels and household compositions, and have varying levels of English proficiency. Feedback from cognitive testing is used to create standardized translation glossaries, which are used consistently across all non-English materials.

Recommendation #19: We recommend that the Flashcard Tool include each of the languages available for the language assistance guides.

Census Bureau Response:

The Census Bureau is reviewing the 2010 Census Language Identification Flashcard and assessing the language needs for the 2020 Census using the ACS 5-year and 1-year estimates. We are planning to work with other operations, stakeholders, and experts to explore the optimal way to present the message and languages considered for this product.

The current Language Identification Flashcard is also being tested in focus groups with non-English speaking respondents. Focus group participants are shown videos of enumerators and respondents encountering a language barrier at a respondent doorstep. The focus group participant is then shown the flashcard, and provides his or her feedback on the wording and planned use of the card.

Recommendation #20: We recommend that Census Bureau create non-English scripts for enumerators to utilize in the field that addresses the different issues that could arise to ensure consistency of in-field translations. We further recommend that the Census Bureau discourage on-the-fly translations by its enumerators.

Census Bureau Response:

The Census Bureau agrees that “on-the-fly” translations are not recommended, as they potentially threaten data quality. However, we also recognize that emergent respondent issues and concerns will occur during enumeration. We are exploring the option of providing additional resources for non-English speaking enumerators in their training

National Advisory Committee on Racial, Ethnic and Other Populations

Fall Meeting

U.S. Census Bureau

4600 Silver Hill Road, Suitland, MD 20746

November 3-4, 2016

materials and to provide them with guidance on terminology and ways to engage non-English speaking respondents.

We will use Computer Assisted Translation tools to create a terminology database during the translation of the instruments and the Language Assistance Guides. We will use this to generate terminology lists for our bilingual staff. These translations will undergo expert review to ensure that all terminology is fully vetted before enumerators begin their work. The translation and language services staff will also participate in training for Partnership Specialists/Assistants to provide guidance and resources on engaging with non-English speaking respondents.

The Census Bureau will also develop a process to react swiftly to emergent respondent questions and concerns, such as those discovered by Census Questionnaire Assistance agents. This process will ensure that translations are quickly developed and disseminated across operations.

Language Assistance Guides (LAGs)

Recommendation #21: We recommend that the Census Bureau produce a paper/printable version of their LAGs. We further recommend that the LAGs must be readable (i.e. font-size and type support user readability) and that it is clear the LAGs are to be used as guides and not filled out as questionnaires.

Census Bureau Response:

The Census Bureau is planning to provide Language Assistance Guides (LAGs) to assist people in understanding and completing the 2020 Census online. Additionally, for households without or with limited access to the Internet, we will provide paper LAGs to assist people in understanding, completing, and returning the 2020 Census paper questionnaire. Any digital or electronic LAGs (including pdf, video, etc.) will be compliant with Section 508 of the Rehabilitation Act of 1974, in order to provide comparable access to people with disabilities. Additionally, LAGs will be available in large print, in braille, and in American Sign Language.

LAGs designed to guide respondents through the paper questionnaire will show a visual depiction of the paper questionnaire; however, it is important that people do not confuse the LAGs with questionnaires (and are discouraged from providing a response on the LAG itself). The LAGs for the paper questionnaire will explain the sections of the English questionnaire, explain how to complete the questionnaire, and guide the respondent to return the questionnaire. We are also exploring the optimal layout of these LAGs, including potentially expanding the number of pages and designing the LAGs not to mimic the actual paper questionnaire.

National Advisory Committee on Racial, Ethnic and Other Populations

Fall Meeting

U.S. Census Bureau

4600 Silver Hill Road, Suitland, MD 20746

November 3-4, 2016

Recommendation #22: We recommend that instructional videos on how to fill out the census questionnaire should start with a segment on why participating in the census matters/is important. We further recommend that the instructional videos be produced both as one whole video as well as in segments (e.g. why participating in the census is important, filling out the question(s) on race and ethnicity, etc.).

Census Bureau Response:

While the 2010 Census Language Assistance Guides (LAGs) were paper-based only, the Census Bureau is planning different options for deploying the 2020 Census LAGs in various formats, including video and paper. We are currently planning to offer video LAGs (supporting the Internet questionnaire) as one complete video, as well as shorter chapter-style videos.

As the plan stands, the videos will show the user's view of the instrument as he/she navigates through the screens, with callouts that highlight the portion of the screen described. Videos will include captioning and narration in the supported languages, including American Sign Language. The videos will include culturally appropriate translated captioning and vocal narration to guide respondents to complete their response on the Internet.

The videos will provide information on the importance of participating in the census, as well as the background information on each of the questionnaire topic. We plan to deploy segments of these videos to be used at different communications and partnership events to motivate people to respond to the 2020 Census in multiple languages. We will also ensure that these videos are available on the webpages where non-English speaking respondents would find other materials in each language.

Recommendation #23: We recommend that instructional videos be cast in a way that is representative of the diversity of the communities they are targeting.

Census Bureau Response:

The current plan for the video Language Assistance Guides is to show the user's view of the Internet questionnaire as he/she navigates through the screens, with callouts that highlight the portion of the screen described. If people are needed, we will seek talent that is representative of the diversity of the communities we seek to reach.

Recommendation #24: We recommend that an instructional video be created for filling out the paper questionnaire, which can be used by partner organizations, YouTube and other distribution mechanism.

Census Bureau Response:

While the 2010 Census Language Assistance Guides (LAGs) were paper-based only, the Census Bureau is planning different options of deploying the 2020 Census LAGs in various formats, including instructional videos and paper guides. The LAGs will be

National Advisory Committee on Racial, Ethnic and Other Populations

Fall Meeting

U.S. Census Bureau

4600 Silver Hill Road, Suitland, MD 20746

November 3-4, 2016

intended primarily for respondents of Limited English Proficiency, who require non-English assistance with self-responding to the census. However, the LAGs will also be made available for Census Bureau Partnership Staff, partnership organizations, and the general public. These materials will be accessible via the Internet (instructional videos and paper guides) and in print (paper guides).

Community Education & Partnership materials

Recommendation #25: We recommend that the Census Bureau develop educational and communications materials with simpler messages and plain-language translations. In 2010, community members found the Census-produced materials to be too dense and text-heavy, and in some cases, too complicated for those who may not be literate in their own native language.

Census Bureau Response:

The Census Bureau's Language Services operation and Integrated Partnership and Communications (IPC) operation will work collaboratively to communicate the importance of participating in the 2020 Census to the entire population. We plan to engage and motivate people to self-respond in the supported languages, with messaging that is simple and effective. To ensure the success of the 2020 Census, the IPC operational plan is developed based on the lessons learned from Census 2000, the 2010 Census, research findings, and census tests results.

Recommendation #26: We recommend that the Census Bureau produce educational and communications materials that provide concrete examples of how participating in the Census can directly benefit different language communities.

Census Bureau Response:

As described in #25, the Census Bureau will use information about the benefits of participating in the decennial census to engage and motivate non-English speaking respondents to self-respond. We are always looking for case studies that can link the use of census data directly to benefits and services at the community level and will continue to gather examples to use for this purpose.

Recommendation #27: We recommend that the Census Bureau review all its educational and communications materials to ensure that they are culturally appropriate (i.e. no offensive or inappropriate imagery, whether of people, places, etc.).

Census Bureau Response:

The Census Bureau will engage partners, subject matter experts, stakeholders, and representatives from each target audience to ensure that all census materials are sensitive to the cultural and language needs of the country and will develop a process to consider guidance on cultural and language issues. Partnership Specialists will be encouraged to

National Advisory Committee on Racial, Ethnic and Other Populations

Fall Meeting

U.S. Census Bureau

4600 Silver Hill Road, Suitland, MD 20746

November 3-4, 2016

ensure cultural and language factors are considered as outreach efforts are planned. Additionally, the Integrated Communications Contract partners with several multicultural subcontractors to ensure that non-English promotional materials, and paid advertising in multiple languages is culturally appropriate as well.

Telephone Questionnaire Assistance

Recommendation #28: We recommend that the Census Bureau continue to expand the ability of all people to fill out their census form over the phone. We further recommend that the Census Bureau look at expanding the number of languages supported by the Telephone Questionnaire Assistance beyond the Tier 1 languages. The Bureau should look to target languages that are linguistically isolated, are Hard-to-Count, and have low response rates.

Census Bureau Response:

The 2020 Census Questionnaire Assistance (CQA) will be available to everyone who has a question about the census or who wishes to complete the questionnaire. We will also expand language services by allowing respondents to provide their information by phone through the entirety of 2020 Census operations and offer more languages than were offered for the 2010 Census. The CQA interviews will be made available in the same languages offered on the Internet questionnaire for the 2020 Census. Additionally, respondents will be able to request mailed copies of the Language Assistance Guides during the 2020 Census, beyond the number of languages available for the interviews.

Website

Recommendation #29: We recommend that the Census Bureau/2020 Census Website support at least all the languages of the LAGs. We further recommend that the individual pages for non-English and non-Spanish languages be comprehensive, clear and properly translated.

Census Bureau Response:

The Census Bureau is planning to deploy a mirror website in Spanish for the 2020 Census, webpages that provide information about the 2020 Census in multiple non-English languages, links to the Internet questionnaire in approximately 10 languages, video and downloadable paper Language Assistance Guides in approximately 60 languages, and other informational materials. With respect to translation, as explained in the response to Recommendation #9, we will follow the translation guidelines set forth in “ASTM F2575-14: Standard Guide for Quality Assurance in Translation” to ensure translated materials are accurate, comprehensive, and culturally relevant.

National Advisory Committee on Racial, Ethnic and Other Populations

Fall Meeting

U.S. Census Bureau

4600 Silver Hill Road, Suitland, MD 20746

November 3-4, 2016

Recommendation #30: We recommend that the Census Bureau continue testing how to most effectively let users know from the main page of the “2020 Census Website” that these non-English resources exist and how to reach them.

Census Bureau Response:

Through mid-decade testing, the Census Bureau has refined strategies on deploying the non-English resources online and making it clear to the respondents that non-English pages are available. We will continue to research optimal ways of informing users that non-English resources are available on the 2020 Census website, as well as leverage the Integrated Partnership and Communications operation to inform the public of these resources.